

Minutes
Ashtabula County Senior Services Levy Advisory Board
September 11, 2019

Present

Patrick Arcaro
Jerome Brockway
Neroy Carter
Paul Fuller
Susan Hill
Mary Pepperney
Mary Runyan
Dianne Solembrino
Virginia Walker
Jane Wallace
Pam Zack
Lynn Zalewski

Absent

Willietta Bunch-
Marbury
Michelle Thomas

Staff

Ronald Smith
Alissa Drees
Darcy Mosier

BOCC

Kathryn Whittington

Call to Order

Dr. Brockway called the meeting to order.

Approval of Minutes

Dr. Brockway asked the board to review the minutes from May 15th, 2019 and the discussion notes from July 10th, 2019. After the board reviewed the minutes and discussion notes, Mary Runyan made the motion to approve the minutes from May 15th, 2019 and discussion notes from July 10th, 2019. Susan Hill seconded the motion. Motion carried.

Chair's Report

Dr. Brockway brought the boards attention to the date March 17th, 2020. Dr. Brockway stated this date was selected by the General Assembly of the State of Ohio for the primary election. Dr. Brockway asked the Senior Levy Campaign Planning Committee to set a date to begin conversing and planning for the campaign. Dr. Brockway suggested the first week in October. Dr. Brockway reminded the board of Feed the Hope; September 13th, 2019 at Town Square Mall, 9a.m. and invited those interested to volunteer for the event.

Funding

Ron Smith presented the Revenue & Expense Report as of August 31st, 2019. He stated the year began with \$968,429.59. The current year revenue from taxes collected from Senior Levy is \$1,774,839.03 for a total amount of \$2,743,268.62. The total expenses YTD were \$1,150,705.20 leaving an estimated, unobligated available balance of \$260,214.62.

Contract Reports

Contract Report: Darcy Mosier presented the contract report. This report represents payments made against provider's contracts beginning January 1, 2019 through the calendar year. Darcy reported that all the providers should have used approximately 58% of their annual budget. Darcy reported there are some providers not able to meet their target due to staffing issues. Country Neighbor Program was at 54%. Barb Klingensmith, Executive Director of CNP stated they have begun their own certified training programs for both homemaker and personal care in hopes of resolving the ongoing staffing issues. Ashtabula County Community Action Agency; Homemaker was at 52%. ACCAA stated they were down one homemaker in July but have since filled the position in August. Lynn Zalewski also explained why Catholic Charities of Ashtabula County services comes in low at 34%. Lynn stated Catholic Charities of Ashtabula County has two billing sources and once one source is exhausted they begin using the Senior Levy source. Those above the target are Geneva at 68%, YMCA at 71% and CNP Transportation at 69%. At this time those providers above target have not asked for additional funds for the 2019 FY contract. Paul Fuller noted the case count for Adult Protective Services have increased, year to date from 85 to 155.

Wait List: Darcy Mosier reported, as of July 31st, 2019, Ashtabula Regional Home Health Services had 33 clients on the waitlist for Personal Care Services, while Country Neighbor had 6 clients for Personal Care, on their waitlist. Alissa Drees added that Ashtabula Regional Home Health Services remaining budget for FY 2019 does not allow them the ability to add any more clients. Alissa went on to share that the waitlist may continue to increase due to this issue. In addition, Country Neighbor had 30 seniors on the waitlist for Homemaker services while actively serving 100 seniors. CNP waitlist is solely due to staffing. CNP has indicated they have hired 3 more staff and is now providing their own training. Ashtabula County Community Action Agency had 5 on their waitlist while serving 88 individuals. Mary Pepperney shared her concern of the growing waitlists and the providers measurable outcomes with their staffing crisis. The committee discussed the ongoing theme of staffing challenges. Kathryn Whittington expressed the challenges faced are staffing, funding availability, resources, duplication of services and looking at what is already available. Alissa Drees confirmed provider's challenges of seeking applicants to fill personal care positions and Mary Pepperney conquers. Paul Fuller adds this is a bigger issue and goes beyond Ashtabula County. Paul went on to note as this population ages the need for personal care is going to grow and the challenge is not only having money to pay wages, it is also finding people to do a very difficult job. Patrick Arcaro adds in terms of staffing issues and economic development; this issue is much more global than just in our area. Alissa Drees suggested addressing these concerns through the Personal Care and Wellness committee. Dr. Brockway suggested moving forward, we look at where funds are being spent with current provider services, prioritize needs while garnering more individual interest.

Old Business

Dr. Brockway asked the board for ratification of the \$10,000.00 donated to Feed the Hope. Motion made by Pam Zack. Mary Runyan seconded the motion. Motion moved.

New Business

Personal Care waitlist information provided, and the board will continue to address this ongoing concern.

Country Neighbor Program request an increase of \$23,004.00 for Home Delivered Meals to provide an additional 2,840 meals in the 2019 contract year.

Dr. Brockway asked for a motion to increase Country Neighbor Program request for an increase of \$23,004.00 for Home Delivered Meals. Lynn Zalewski made the motion. Dianne Solembrino seconded the motion. Motion moved.

RFP Pre-Selection Meeting- Listed below are the recommendations of the evaluation committees.

1. Independence & Wellness:

- i. Ashtabula County Community Action Agency requested amount \$5,500.00, unit rate \$9.29. No increase in amount nor unit rate. Committee recommends amount requested.
- ii. Ashtabula County YMCA requested \$26,265.13 with a unit rate of \$4.41. The Committee recommended \$22,600.44 with a unit rate of \$4.02.
- iii. Ashtabula County Council On Aging requested \$66,157.00, unit rate of \$15.75. The Committee recommended \$53,680.00 with a unit rate of \$15.75.
- iv. Conneaut Human Resource Center requested \$30,600.00, unit rate of \$17.00. Committee recommended \$28,800.00.
- v. Country Neighbor Program, Inc.- Independence and Wellness requested \$64,485.60, unit rate of \$22.16. The committee recommended \$53,693.00, unit rate of \$22.16.
- vi. Country Neighbor Program, Inc.-Congregate Meals requested \$23,400.00, unit rate of \$6.50. Committee recommends proposed amount and approved the unit rate increase of \$6.35 to \$6.50.
- vii. Geneva Area Seniors Corporation requested \$73,776.00, unit rate of \$12.38. the Committee recommended amount requested which was no increase in amount nor unit rate from last year.

RFP Evaluation Discussion-

Lynn Zalewski, Independence & Wellness Evaluation Committee member explained to the board the providers receiving technology funds for FY 2019 asked for an increase for the FY 2020. Lynn expressed the Evaluation Committees thoughts by saying the expectation of the committee for FY 2019 was that the Technology funds would not continue from year to year and noting that libraries have the capabilities to provide some of the technology components and services. The Chair asked for comments from the floor. Patrick Arcaro questioned the request from the Conneaut Human Resource Center stating the amount requested was very close from the recommended amount with a difference of \$1,800. Patrick explained he was not clear why the Evaluation Committee chose not to recommend the requested amount. Kathryn Whittington asked the reasons behind the committee's recommendation for \$28,800.00. Dr. Brockway stated the committee looked at the activity of FY 2019, it was not at the levels of the previous years. Darcy Mosier expresses Conneaut

Human Resource Center's explanation for the requested increase in the amount was due to their desire to provide additional hours for senior advocacy and adding hours to expand senior programs.

viii. Dr. Brockway asked if there is a motion to accept the committee's recommendation to accept the increase for Conneaut Human Resource Center of \$1,800.00 with a total request of \$30,600.00 and the Evaluation Committees recommendations for each of the Independence & Wellness contracts. Virginia Walker made the motion to approve the Committees recommendation. Susan Hill seconded the motion. Mary Pepperney abstained and opposed.

Lynn Zalewski proposes this is an area where the committee needs to look at prioritization of what the levy wants to fund and how that proposal meets those priorities. Lynn suggest for future RFP's, that if you meet the priorities of the levy, there should be a metric that you get additional points for meeting those priorities verses those that do not meet the priorities. This will then connect to how the agencies are being scored in the future. At this time, they are all scoring well, but once the priorities are identified the committee will need to make sure the proposal meets those priorities. Mary Pepperney expands the discussion by stating her concern is, what are we getting from the Independence & Wellness programs/services. She adds that Independence & Wellness services take a significant portion of the Senior Levy dollars. Dr. Brockway proposes the board explore ideas for next year's RFP's. For instance, they may create a rubric that would identify the needs and priorities. He adds, prior years there was a way of tracking how providers were using the monies. He went on to say, perhaps the board will have to recraft or redo the RFP's moving forward.

2. Chore Services:

- i. Ashtabula County Council on Aging requested \$25,102.00, unit rate of \$19.31. The Committee recommended the increase amount requested of \$2,802.00 with no increase in unit rate.
- ii. Conneaut Human Resource Center did not submit a proposal for the 2020 FY.
- ii. Country Neighbor Program, Inc. requested \$6,782.50, unit rate of \$22.00. The Committee recommended amount requested which was the same as FY 2019 and recommended the rate increase from \$21.53 to \$22.00.
- iii. Lynn Zalewski motioned to approve the funding amounts and unit rates for ACCOA and CNP chore services. Mary Pepperney seconded the motion. Motion moved.

3. Homemaker Services:

- i. Conneaut Human Resource Center requested \$32,000.00, unit rate of \$20.00. The Committee recommended the requested amount. There was no change in the requested amounts from FY 2019.
- ii. Country Neighbor Program, Inc. requested \$103,530.00, unit rate \$21.75. Committee recommended the increase of \$1,396.59 and unit increase from \$21.45 to \$21.75.

iii. Ashtabula County Community Action Agency requested \$92,141.56, unit rate \$25.97. The Committee recommended the increase of \$16.47 with no change in unit rate.

iv. Dr. Brockway went through the evaluation committee's recommendations for each of the Homemaker contracts. Dianne Solebrino made the motion to approve the funding amounts and unit rates for CHRC, CNP and ACCAA. Susan Hill seconded the motion. Motion moved.

4. Guardianship/Payeeship Services:

i. Catholic Charities of Ashtabula County requested \$59,728.90, unit rate of \$78.00/\$66.88. The Committee recommended the amount requested with no change from previous year.

ii. Dr. Brockway went through the evaluation committee's recommendation for Catholic Charities of Ashtabula County, Guardianship/Payeeship Services. A motion to approve the funding amount and unit rates was made by Paul Fuller and Susan Hill seconded the motion. Mary Pepperney abstained.

5. Home Delivered Meals Services:

i. Ashtabula County Community Action Agency requested \$339,037.83, unit rate of \$7.92. The Committee recommended to decrease the amount requested by \$23,029.83 to \$316,008.00 and approved the unit rate.

ii. Country Neighbor Program, Inc. requested \$205,659.00, unit rate of \$8.10. The Committee recommended the requested amount and unit rate which is the result of an increase in units of 2,840 after SLAB requested CNP to eliminate their waitlist in FY 2019 resulting in an increase amount of \$23,004.00.

RFP Evaluation Discussion-

Neroy Carter asked why the decrease in the recommended amount for ACCAA. Darcy Mosier explains the committee recommended to decrease the amount requested by \$23,029.83 and recommended the increase of \$0.02 for the unit rate. This will result in a decrease in the units purchased by 2,915. The committee agreed to monitor the effect and wait list to assess further action if needed and as funds are available.

ii. Dr. Brockway went through the evaluation committee's recommendations for each of the Home Delivered Meals service contracts. Lynn Zalewski made a motion to approve the funding amounts and unit rates and Neroy Carter seconded the motion. Motion moved.

6. Personal Care Services:

- i. Ashtabula Regional Home Health Services requested \$175,550.00, unit rate of \$35.11. The Committee recommended to give the unit rate of \$35.11 and \$126,396.00, the same amount as FY 2019 to keep within the Senior Levy budget constraints.
- ii. Country Neighbor Program, Inc. requested \$57,972.30, unit rate \$25.95. The Committee recommended the requested amount and the requested increase in unit rate from \$25.45 to \$25.95.

RFP Evaluation Discussion-

Mary Pepperney shared there was great reservation among the committee members to recommend the requested funding, unit rates along with the increase in units. Dr. Brockway added ARHHS proposed an increase in 3700 units which drove the increase in requested funds. Dr. Brockway added the thoughts of the committee would be to fund at the committees recommended amount then track activity.

- iii. Dr. Brockway went through the evaluation committee's recommendations for each of the Personal Care Services. Pam Zack made a motion to approve the funding amounts and unit rates. Dianne Solebrino seconded the motion. Mary Pepperney abstained.

7. Transportation Services:

- i. Country Neighbor Program, Inc. requested \$318,240.00, unit rate of \$1.95. The Committee recommended the requested amount of \$318,240.00 and increase the unit rate of \$1.87 to \$1.95.
- ii. ACTS requested \$71,572.80, unit rate of \$58.25/hr. The Committee recommended amount requested and unit rate increase from \$53.48/hr. to \$58.25/hr.
- iii. Richmond Transportation requested \$110,151.00, unit rate of \$2.20. The Committee recommended Richmond Transportation not be considered as a provider due to the cost per hour, per client.

RFP Evaluation Discussion-

Alissa Drees confirmed Country Neighbor Program contract report is well above their percentage of uses. Alissa reminded the board CNP receives the request from ACJFS under Senior Levy and they do not have control of how many clients they are serving because they receive the request from ACJFS. Alissa adds they do consolidate rides to be as efficient as possible. Alissa confirms CNP monthly increase for the FY 2019 has been steadily growing and above their monthly target. The medical rides are driving the percentage increase specifically for dialysis and out of town medical visits. Darcy Mosier adds many of the dialysis locations locally are often booked and force clients to go out of county for their treatments. Lynn Zalewski adds those rides classified under socialization were not necessarily socialization but were rides to grocery store, social security office, laundromat, court/jury duty, senior center, HEAP to name a few.

iv. Dr. Brockway went through the evaluation committee's recommendations for each of the Transportation Service contracts and not fund Richmond Transportation. Paul Fuller made a motion to approve the funding amounts and unit rates for CNP and ACTS services and Susan Hill seconded the motion. Motion moved.

2020 Senior Conference venue and contract

Dr. Brockway explains Lakeside High School would like to enter into a contract for the 2020 Senior Conference. The contract will include providing tables, chairs, equipment, set up and custodian availability for \$500, food service staff for \$720.00 and a contract for a total of \$1,220.00. As a comparison from Aztek Rentals for tables and chairs for the 2019 Senior Conference at \$1,055.00. A comparable cost with the set up from Ashtabula Area City Schools the committee might look at raising the vendor fee by \$5.00 to cover difference. Dr. Brockway added the meal cost increase proposed by AACSS is \$5.00 to \$6.50. Dr. Brockway stated that the Senior Conference Committee can explore possible meal options if they choose, look at the cost and let AACSS know the committee would like to enter into a contract with them. Alissa Drees explained we have inquired to see if they have enough tables and chairs for both the cafetorium where the attendees sit for lunch and the vendors in the gymnasium. Darcy Mosier added LHS has been contacted to see if they are able to provide both tables and chairs for the event and if not a small number of tables may still be needed for the vending area and may be rented from Aztek Rental.

Dr. Brockway asked the board if there is a motion to approve entering into a contract with Ashtabula Area City School System for the 2020 Senior Conference venue. Dianne Solembrino made a motion to approve the venue and contract for Lakeside High School to host the 2020 Senior Levy Conference. Susan Hill seconded the motion. Motion moved.

Public Comment

No public available for comment.

Adjourn

Susan Hill made the motion to adjourn the meeting. Jane Wallace seconded the motion. Motion moved. The meeting was adjourned.

**Next Board Meeting
November 6th, 2019 at 10 a.m.
Ohio Means Jobs**